Don't repair that island! It ain't broke.

Klaus Abels

UCL

k.abels@ucl.ac.uk

November 18, 2011

Introduction

(1) Ever since J. R. Ross, 1969, island repair under sluicing has been used to argue that island constraints are global derivational constraints or must be understood representationally:

a. "What this means is the following: the constraints on chopping rules proposed in J. Ross, 1967 cannot be locally defined — rather, they must be derivational constraints, in the sense of Lakoff, 1969" (J. R. Ross, 1969, p. 276).

b. "[I]t is assumed that there is a designated symbol # which cannot appear internally to a well-formed surface structure" (Chomsky, 1972, p. 71. Because the island bearing # is deleted under sluicing, relevant derivations are "not 'filtered out' as deviant by the output condition that # cannot appear internally in a surface structure. [...] The point is of some interest..." (Chomsky, 1972, p. 72).

(2) The strongest syntactic arguments for hidden structure at ellipsis sites comes from constraints imposed by such structure which are hard to capture without assuming the presence of such structure.

a. case-matching
b. preposition (non-)stranding
c. syntactic islands

1   Stripping

(3) Case

Er ist des Albanischen mächtig, und auch {des
he is the Albanian powerful and also the.GEN
Griechischen | *das Griechische | *dem Griechischen}
Greek the.ACC Greek the.DAT Greek
He masters Albanian and also Greek. German

(4) Preposition (non-)stranding see Fukaya, 2007[1]

a. Ich habe gestern mit Anna geredet und mit Sakis (auch).
I have yesterday with Anna spoken and with Sakis (too)
I spoke with Anna yesterday and with Sakis, too. German

b. Ich habe gestern mit Anna geredet und Sakis (auch).
I have yesterday with Anna spoken and Sakis (too)
I spoke with Anna yesterday, and Sakis did, too.

c. I talked with Anna yesterday, and (with) Sakis. German

d. Milisa me ton Saki xthes, kai *(me) tin Anna. English
I.spoke with the Sakis yesterday and with the Anna
I spoke with Sakis yesterday, and with Sakis, too. Greek
Merchant, 2003

e. Milisa me ton Saki kai tin Anna xthes.
I.spoke with the Saki and the Anna yesterday.
I spoke with Sakis yesterday and Anna did, too Greek
Merchant, 2003

f. Juan escribe para Clarín y *(para) La Nación también
Juan writes for Clarin and for The Nation too
Juan writes for Clarin and for La Nación as well. Spanish
Depiante, 2000

(5) Long movement[2]

a. Lucie will admit that she stole the diamonds if you press her, but
not the car. Reinhart, 1993

b. Ingrid gibt bestimmt zu, dass sie das Auto gestohlen
Ingrid gives undoubtedly to that she the.ACC car stolen
hat, wenn du sie etwas unter Druck setzt, aber
has, if you her somewhat under pressure sets, but
den Diamanten niemals.
the.ACC diamond never
Ingrid will admit that she stole the car if you press her, but no
the diamond German

---

[1]Nakao, 2009 also discusses many of these issues. Nakao's Japanese paradigms are less well controlled than Fukaya's, whose thesis, strangely enough, is not cited at all.

[2]For relevant discussion of locality issues in stripping see also Fukaya, 2007; Merchant, in press and for fragment answers Merchant, 2004; Temmerman, to appear.

(6)   Complex NP/subject condition

a.   *The fact that some politician has resigned got much publicity,
     but not the defense minisiter.   Depiante, 2000

b.   Die Tatsache, dass von Guttenberg abgeschrieben hat, hat die
     the fact   that von Guttenberg plagiarized   has has the
     Gemüter erregt, aber Koch-Mehrin nicht.
     souls   stirred but Koch-Mehrin not
     =   The fact that von Guttenberg plagiarized has caused a big
          stir, but Koch-Mehrin hasn't caused a big stir.
     ≠   The fact that von Guttenberg plagiarized has caused a big
          stir, but the fact that Koch-Mehring plagiarized hasn't caused
          a big stir.   German

(7)   Complex NP (relative clause)

a.   I met a boy who ate an apple and also an orange. Nakao, 2009,
     p. 99
     =   I met a boy who ate both an apple and and orange.
     ≠   I met a boy who ate an apple and I also met a (different)
          boy who ate an orange

b.   Ich habe einen Jungen, der einen   Apfel gegessen hat,
     I   have a   boy   who an.ACC apple eaten   has
     getroffen, und eine   Apfelsine auch.
     met   and an.ACC orange   too
     =   one boy eats both
     ≠   two boys eat one each   German

(8)   Adjunct condition

a.   John left because you played this song, but not *that song* Nakao,
     2009, p. 99
     ≠   He left because you played this song; the reason for his
          leaving was not that you played that other song, which you
          did.
     =   The reason for his leaving was that you played this song
          and failed to play that other song.

b.   Hans ist gegangen, weil   du Yesterday gespielt hast, aber
     Hans is left   because you Yesterday played   has but
     Iron Man nicht.
     Iron Man not
     ≠   Hans left because you played Yesterday. The reason for his
          leaving was not that you played Iron Man, which you did.

> = The reason for Hans leaving was that you played Yesterday and failed to play Iron Man.

2 VP ellipsis

I consider only English data here. Relevant examples illustrating case connectivity and prepositional pied-piping can be found in the literature on remnant VP ellipsis (e.g., Goldberg, 2005).Unfortunately, the possibility of A-moving from elided VPs in Dutch *Modal Complement Ellipsis* is severely restricted (Abels, 2012; Aelbrecht, 2010).

(9) a. Short movevement Fox and Lasnik, 2003; Merchant, 2008; Park, 2004; Shuyler, 2002

    I know what I like and what I don't.   Shuyler, 2002
    b. Long movement   based on Fiengo and May, 1994, 229, fn. 31
    ? I know which book MAX thinks Mary wants, and which book BILL does.   tracecolorthink Mary wants

(10) Complex NP (relative clause)
    * Abby {wants | does want} to hire someone who speaks {GREEK | a certain Balkan language}, but I don't remember what (kind of) language she DOESN'T.   tracecolorwant to hire anybody who speaks

(11) Adjunct condition
    a. *BEN left the party because Carlene/some guest insulted him, but God only knows which guest ABBY did.   tracecolorleave the party because insulted her
    b. *John will leave if more people come to the party than you will. tracecolorleave if come to the party

3 Contrast Sluicing

(12) Case

    Hans   hat der   Frau   geholfen, aber ich weiss nicht,
    Hans.NOM has the.DAT woman helped   but I   know not
    {wer | wem | *wen}   noch.
     who.NOM   who.DAT   who.ACC else
    who.NOM Hans helped the woman but I don't know who else helped her.

who.DAT Hans helped the woman but I don't know who else he helped. German

(13) Preposition Stranding

    a. John talked with the woman but I don't know who else.
       ...John talked with
       ...talked with the woman

    b. Hans hat mit der Frau geredet, aber ich weiss nicht
       Hans has with the.DAT woman talked but I know not
       *(mit) wem noch.
         with who.DAT else
       Hans talked with the woman, but I don't know with who else
       he talked. German

(14) Long movement

    Veronika glaubt, dass Hans seine Schwester
    Veronika believes that Hans his.ACC.F.SG sister
    umgebracht hat, aber ich weiss nicht, wen noch.
    killed has, but I know not who.ACC else
    Veronika believes that Hans killed his sister, but I don't know
    who else Veronika believes that Hans killed. German

(15) Complex NP/subject condition

    a. *The fact that von Guttenberg plagiarized has caused a big stir, but I don't know who else.

    b. *Die Behauptung, dass von Guttenberg abgeschrieben hat, hat
       the claim that von Guttenberg plagiarized has has
       die Gemüter erregt, aber ich weiss nicht wer noch.
       the souls stirred but I know not who.NOM else

    German

(16) Complex NP/relative clause[3]

    a. I met a boy who was eating an apple, but I won't tell you what else.
    = ...he was eating.
    ≠ ...for what other thing x I met a (different) boy who was eating x.

    b. Ich habe einen Jungen getroffen, der einen Apfel gegessen
       I have a boy met who an.ACC apple eaten

---

[3]For careful and particularly insightful discussion see Fukaya, 2007.

hat, aber ich sage dir nicht, was   noch.
has but I   tell you not   what.ACC else

=   one boy eats both things

≠   two boys eat one thing each   German

(17)   Adjunct Condition

     a.   John went to the headmaster after he had had a fight with Mr Miller, but I don't know with who else.

=   ...he had had a fight with (on that occasion).

≠   ...but I don't know who else is such that there is some (other) occasion where John went to the headmaster after he had had a fight with that other person.

     b.   Hans ist zum   Direktor   gegangen, nachdem er sich
Hans is to.the.DAT headmaster gone   after   he self
mit Frau Paraskewas gestritten hatte, aber ich weiss nicht
with Mrs Paraskewas fight   had, but I   know not
mit wem   noch.
with who.DAT else

=   one trip to the headmaster, one fight with several people

≠   two trips to the headmaster, two fights with one person each

4   Sluicing

(18)   Case J. R. Ross, 1969, 253, ex. 4 for much cross-linguistic data see Merchant, 2001

       Er will   jemandem   schmeicheln, aber sie   wissen nicht
He wants somebody.DAT flatter   but they know   not
{*wen | wem}.
   who.ACC   who.DAT
He wants to flatter somebody, but they don't know who. German

(19)   Preposition (non-)stranding see Merchant, 2001 for cross-linguistic data

     a.   English

       (i)   Peter was talking with someone, but I don't know (with) who.

       (ii)   Who was Peter talking with?

     b.   German

       (i)   Peter hat mit jemandem   geredet, aber ich weiss
Peter has with someone.DAT talked   but I   know

nicht *(mit) wem.
        not   with who.DAT
    (ii) *Wem   hat Peter mit geredet?
        who.DAT has Peter with talked

(20)   A number of empirical challenges have been raised for Merchant's generalization that all and only those languages that allow P-stranding under *wh*-movement allow P-stranding under sluicing:

  a. Serbo Croatian (Stjepanović, 2008)
  b. Polish (Szczegielniak, 2005, 2008)
  c. Brazilian Portuguese (Almeida and Yoshida, 2007; Rodrigues, Nevins, and Vicente, 2009)
  d. Spanish (Rodrigues, Nevins, and Vicente, 2009; Vicente, 2006)
  e. Indonesian (Fortin, 2007; Sato, 2007, 2010)
  f. Amis (Wei, 2011)
  g. English (Fortin, 2007; Nykiel and Sag, 2009)

(21)   Complex NP (relative clause)[4]

  a. They wanted to hire someone who speaks a Balkan language, but I don't remember which.
  b. Sie   wollten jemanden anstellen, der einer (bestimmten)
      They wanted somebody hire   who a.DAT certain
      Balkansprache   mächtig ist, aber ich weiss nicht mehr
      Balkan language powerful is but I   know not   longer
      welcher   (Balkansprache).
      which.DAT Balkan language

(22)   Complex NP (complement clause)

  a. The administration issued a statement that it is willing to meet with one of the student groups, but I'm not sure which one.
  b. Die Verwaltung   hat das Gerücht bestätigt, dass sie mit
      the administration has the rumor   confirmed that it with
      einer Gewerkschaft verhandeln wird, aber ich bin nicht sicher
      one   union   negotiate will, but I   am not   sure
      mit   welcher.
      with which

(23)   Clausal subject

  a. That certain countries would vote against the resolution has been widely reported, but I'm not sure which ones.

---

[4]Unless mentioned otherwise, the English examples are from Merchant, 2001.

    b.   Dass der Text der   Resolution bestimmten Ländern nicht
         that the text the.GEN resolution certain.DAT countries not
         gefällt, ist oft   behauptet worden, aber ich bin nicht sicher
         pleases is often claimed   been   but I am not   sure
         welchen   Ländern.
         which.DAT countries
         That the text of the resolution would not please certain countries
         has often been claimed, but I am not sure which countries.

(24)   Adjunct condition

    a.   Ben will be mad if Abby talks to one of the teachers, but she
        couldn't remember which.

    b.   Ben wird sich ärgern, wenn Andrea mit einem der Lehrer
        Ben will self anger   when Andrea with one   the teachers
        spricht, aber sie konnte sich nicht erinnern   mit welchem
        talks   but she could self not   remember with which
        (Lehrer).
         teacher

    c.   Ben left the party because one of the guests insulted him, but
        he wouldn't tell me which.

    d.   Ben ist abgehauen, weil   er mit einem der Gäste Streit
        Ben is left   because he with one   the guests quarrel
        hatte, aber er wollte mir nicht verraten mit welchem.
        had   but he wanted me not   tell   with which

(25)   Coordinate Structure Constraint

    a. ?They persuaded Kennedy and some other Senator to jointly
        sponsor the legislation, but I can't remember which one.

    b.   Sie   haben Arnim und einen Syntaktiker dazu   überredet,
        they have Arnim and a   syntactician there.to convinced
        gemeinsam einen Sammelband herauszubringen, aber ich
        together   a   collection   to.edit,   but I
        weiss nicht mehr   welchen Syntaktiker.
        know not   longer which   syntactician
        They convinced Arnim and a syntactician to edit a volume to-
        gether, but I can't remember which syntactician.

    c.   Bob ate dinner and saw a movie that night, but he didn't say
        which (movie).

    d.   Fritz hat gestern   Abend Chips gegessen und einen Film
        Fritz has yesterday evening chips eaten   and a   film

geguckt, aber ich weiss nicht mehr   welchen Film.
watched, but I   know not   longer which   film

(26)   The Polish, Brazilian Portuguese, and Spanish cases have been ana-
lyzed away in terms of a pseudo-sluicing source, i.e., a source involv-
ing an underlying copular structure.

a.   There is a cautionary tale here about the possible sources for
sluices, which may differ on a case-by-case basis (Craenenbroeck,
2010).

b.   These analyses are problematic for approaches to identity under
ellipsis which require very detailed syntactic identity (e.g. Fox
and Lasnik, 2003 – for further comments see also Potsdam, 2007;
Wei, 2011).

⇒   To rule out pseudo-sluicing as the source, all crucial examples
here will be given in German with case morphology that is in-
compatible with pseudo-sluicing sources.

Reflection

(27)   The vast majority of English data on island amelioration show noth-
ing or serve to increase our suspicions about island-amelioration un-
der sluicing.

(28)   a.   Adjuncts and implicit arguments   probably do not participate
in island amelioration (possibly because of scope)

b.   prosody   irrelevant

c.   aggressive non-D-linking   irrelevant

d.   *mention some* modification   no relevant data (probably no
island amelioration because of scope)

e.   *all* modification   irrelevant

f.   *else* modification   no island amelioration, see above

g.   SWIPING (...who with)   no relevant data available, possibly
limited to sprouting, for which see (a) above

h.   limited cleft strategy   not relevant for English, except see (a)

i.   case matching   not relevant for English

j.   Left Branch Extraction   does not repair islands (Grebenyova,
2005)

5 Island effects under sluicing

German

(29)   Jeder Spieler schreibt einen   Satz   auf, aber er verrät
              Every player   writes   one.ACC sentence up   but   he discloses
              den   anderen nicht welchen.
              the.DAT others   not   which.ACC
              Every player writes down a sentence, but doesn't tell the others
              which.

(30)   Complex NP (relative clause)

         *Jeder Spieler schreibt alle Konsonanten auf, die   in einem
         every player   writes   all   consonants   up   that in a
         (bestimmten) Wort enthalten sind, aber verrät   den anderen
          particular   word contained are   but   discloses the others
         nicht in welchem.
         not   in which
         Every player writes down all consonants that some word contains, but doesn't tell the others which word.[5]

(31)   Complex NP (complement clause)

         *Die Tatsache, dass einem Politiker   sein Doktortitel entzogen
         The fact   that a.DAT politician his   doctor title revoked
         worden ist, hat die Gemüter stark   erregt, aber ich weiss
         become is   has the souls   strongly stirred but   I   know
         nicht mehr welchem   (Politiker).
         not   more which.DAT   politician
         The fact that a (certain) politician had his doctorate revoked caused a big stir, but I don't remember which politician.[6]

---

[5]The example is based on Reinhart's (i), who gives it as good. My own informants do not agree.

(i)   Reinhart, 1997, 346 ex. 223

     a.   Each player must write down all the consonants that some word contains, when properly pronounced, and let the others guess which word.
     b.   Each player x must…let the others guess for which word y, [x wrote down all the consonants y contains when properly pronounced].

[6]This spring several German politicians had their doctorates revoked because of plagiarism. Only for one, the then minister of defense, was there a big public scandal as a

(32)   Subject island

    a. *Dass einem Politiker der Doktortitel entzogen worden ist,
        that a.DAT politician the doctor title revoked   become is
        hat die Gemüter stark   erregt, aber ich weiss nicht mehr
        has the souls   strongly stirred but I   know not   longer
        welchem   (Politiker).
        which.DAT   politician
        That a (certain) politician had his doctorate revoked caused a
        big stir, but I don't remember which politician.

(33)   Adjunct condition

    Situation: *Many people have quarreled with many guests. Many peo-
         ple left as a result of these quarrels. But there is one guest who
         quarreled with many people but these quarrels caused almost no-
         body to leave. Silke was unwilling to disclose the identity of that
         special guest.*

      #Fast   niemand ist abgehauen, weil   er mit einem
      almost nobody   is left   because he with one
      {der   Gäste | bestimmten Gast} gestritten hat, aber Silke
       the.gen guests particular   guest quarreled has, but Silke
      wollte   nicht verraten mit welchem (Gast)
      wanted not   tell   with which   guest
      Almost nobody left because he quarreled with one {of the guests|
      particular guest}, but Silke didn't want to disclose which guest.

Spanish

(34)   Complex NP (relative clause)

      *Cada jugador tiene que escribir todas las consonantes que
      every player   must that write   all   the consonants that
      tenga alguna palabra, y   dejar que los otros averigüen
      holds some   word   and let   that the others guess
      qué   palabra
      which word
      Every player must write down all consonants that some word
      contains and let the others guess which word.

(35)   Complex NP (complement clause)/Subject Condition

      El   hecho de que le   quitaran el   carnet de conducir a
      the fact   of that to.him revoked the license of driving   to

---

result.

un parlamentario causó   un gran escándalo, pero no   me
a MP   caused a big   scandal,   but not me
acuerdo   {a cuál | a quién}.
remember to which to who
The fact that the drivers license of a member of parliament
was revoked caused a big scandal, but I don't remember {which
(politician) |who}.

=   I don't remember {whose | which MPs} driving license was re-
voked

≠   I don't remember for which MP the revocation of that MP's
driving license caused a scandal (while I do remember which
MPs had their licenses revoked).

(36)   Adjunct condition

Casi   nadie   se marchó porque discutiera con cierto
almost nobody self left   because discussed with certain
invitado, pero José no me quiso   decir {con quién | con
guest   but José not me wanted say   with   who   with
cuál}.
which
Almost nobody left because he had a fight with a particular
guest, but José didn't want to tell me with which.

?   in context where many people fought with many people at the
party and many people left as a result, as well. But there was
one guest who fought with many other people but these fights
didn't not cause the guests to leave.

!   The sentence is judged better in this context than expected. I
don't know why.

Other languages

(37)   Elicitation for other languages is ongoing. . .

6   Towards an analysis

(38)   The literature on P-stranding under sluicing suggests that pseudo
sluicing is an option, but only as a last resort (Craenenbroeck, 2010).
The conditions under which case parallelism is obviated in this con-
text remain mysterious.

(39)   Short sources are sometimes required as well.

(40) a. I confirmed the rumor that Mary married someone important,
          but I haven't been able to find out who.
      b. *I confirmed the rumor that Mary married someone important,
          but I haven't been able to find out who I confirmed the rumor
          that Mary married.
      c. I confirmed the rumor that Mary married someone important,
          but I haven't been able to find out who she married.

(41) a. Maryi met a mank who had worked for someone famous,but hek
          wouldn't tell heri who.
      b. *Mary met a man who had worked for someone famous, but he
          wouldn't tell her who she met a man who had worked for.
      c. Mary met a man who had worked for someone famous, but he
          wouldn't tell her who he had worked for.

(42) Note the mismatch between the antecedent, which contains the trace
      of a relative operator in subject position and the presumed short
      sluice, where there is a pronoun.

(43) Changes in the I-domain must be licit under sluicing.

(44) A   Amuse me!
      B   With what?
          What with?
      =   What should I amuse you with?   G. Thoms (p. c.)

(45) Bill seems to be doing away with someone, but he won't say {who |
      *with whom}
      a. Bill won't say who he is doing away with.
      b. #Bill won't say who he seems to be doing away with. J. R. Ross,
          1969, 275, ex. 67–68

(46) Bill mentioned his plans to do away with someone, but he didn't
      mention {who | with whom}
          Bill didn't mention who he plans to do away with   J. R. Ross,
          1969, 275–6, ex. 69–70

(47) Together these considerations allow short construals
      We need them for the *else* cases anyway.

(48) Sie hat einen Jungen getroffen, der einen Apfel gegessen hat, aber
      she has a   boy   met,   who an   apple eaten   has, but
      ich weiß nicht, was   noch.
      I   know not   what else
      She met a boy who was eating an apple, but I dont know what else
      (he was eating).

(49)   Short construals with changes of modal are a powerful device:

(50)   Complex NP (Complementclause)

Die Firmenleitung hat das Gerücht bestritten, dass sie mit
the management   has the rumor   denied   that it   with
der IG Metall   verhandeln wird, aber ich
the metallurgical trade union will,   but   I   know
weiss nicht mit   welcher anderen Gewerkschaft.
not   with   which other   union
Management has denied the rumor that it will negotiate with
the metallurgial union, but I dont know what other union.

=   #...with which other union management will negotiate.

=   ...with which other union management will negociate with
      according to this rumor.

≠   ...I dont know for what other union management denied
      the rumor that it will negotiate with that union.

(51)   German actually has a modal, *sollen*, which can be used in the second
paraphrase and which obviates the need for an explicit *according to
the rumor*

...mit   welcher Gewerkschaft (sie noch verhandeln soll).
...with which   union   (she also negociate   should

(52)   Claim: When pseudo sluicing and modal subordination can be ruled
out, island repair goes away.
Pseudo sluicing is ruled out because of case and PP-pied piping.
Short construals are ruled out semantically.

(53)   Complex NP (relative clause)

*Jeder Spieler schreibt alle Konsonanten auf, die   in einem
every player   writes   all consonants   up   that in a
(bestimmten) Wort enthalten sind, aber verrät   den anderen
 particular   word contained are   but discloses the others
nicht in welchem.
not   in which
Every player writes down all consonants that some word con-
tains, but doesn't tell the others which word.

a.   ...in which they MODAL? are contained.
For speakers who do accept this, there is a bit of wiggle room
by using the contextual restriction on *which word*

(54)   Complex NP (complement clause)

14

> *Die Tatsache, dass einem Politiker sein Doktortitel entzogen
> The fact   that a.DAT politician his   doctor title revoked
> worden ist, hat die Gemüter stark   erregt, aber ich weiss
> become is   has the souls   strongly stirred but I   know
> nicht mehr welchem   (Politiker).
> not   more which.DAT   politician
> The fact that a (certain) politician had his doctorate revoked
> caused a big stir, but I don't remember which politician.

   a.   . . . which politican MODAL? had his doctorate removed.

(55)   Adjunct condition

   Situation: *Many people have quarreled with many guests. Many people left as a result of these quarrels. But there is one guest who quarreled with many people but these quarrels caused almost nobody to leave. Silke was unwilling to disclose the identity of that special guest.*

> #Fast   niemand ist abgehauen, weil   er mit einem
> almost nobody is left   because he with one
> {der   Gäste | bestimmten Gast} gestritten hat, aber Silke
> the.gen guests particular   guest quarreled has, but Silke
> wollte   nicht verraten mit   welchem (Gast)
> wanted not   tell   with which   guest
> Almost nobody left because he quarreled with one {of the guests|
> particular guest}, but Silke didn't want to disclose which guest.

   a.   . . . with which guest he/they/almost nobody (MAY) have quarreled.

7 Conclusions

(56)   There are some further sources of gradience.
Degree of similarity (Arregui et al., 2006; Kim et al., 2011), whereby ratings become worse as similarity decreases.
Local ambiguity as a source of illusory acceptability (Fanselow and Frisch, 2006).

(57)   a.   ich oder er {*bin | *ist | *sind | könnte} an der Reihe sein.
           I   or   he am   is   are   could   at the row   be
           It is/could be my or his turn

(58)   I suspect that the systmatic surface ambiguity of island-violating sluices in English with a pseudo sluicing source leads to a considerable amount of phantom-goodness.

Again compare Fanselow and Frisch, 2006:

(59)   a.   Wem   glaubst du, dass er geholfen hat?
           who.DAT believe you that he helped   has
           Who do you believe he helped.
       b.   ?Wen   glaubst du, dass er gesehen hat?
           who.ACC believe you that he seen   has
           Who do you believe that he has seen.

(60)   a.   Wem   glaubst du?
           who.DAT believe you
           Who do you believe?
       b.   *Wen   glaubst du?
           who.ACC believe you

References

Abels, Klaus (2012). *Phases: An essay on cyclicity in syntax.* Linguistische Arbeiten. Berlin: de Gruyter.

Aelbrecht, Lobke (2010). *The Syntactic Licensing of Ellipsis.* Ed. by Werner Abraham and Elly van Gelderen. Vol. 149. LA. Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Almeida, Diogo and Masaya Yoshida (2007). "A problem for the preposition stranding generalization". In: *Linguistic Inquiry* 38.349–362.

Arregui, Carlos et al. (2006). "Processing elided verb phrases with flawed antecedents: The recycling hypothesis". In: *Journal of Memory and Language* 55.2, pp. 232–246.

Chomsky, Noam (1972). "Some Empirical Issues in the Theory of Transformational Grammar". In: *The Goals of Linguistic Theory.* Ed. by Stanley Peters. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, pp. 63–130.

Craenenbroeck, Jeroen van (2010). "Invisible Last Resort: A note on clefts as the underlying source for sluicing". In: *Lingua* 120.7, pp. 1714–1726.

Depiante, Marcela (2000). "The syntax of deep and surface anaphora: a study of null complement anaphora and stripping/bare argument ellipsis". PhD thesis. Storrs, CT.: Univeristy of Connecticut.

Fanselow, Gisbert and Stefan Frisch (2006). "Effects of Processing Difficulty on Judgements of Acceptability". In: *Gradience in Grammar: Generative Perspectives.* Ed. by Gisbert Fanselow et al. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 291–316.

Fiengo, Robert and Robert May (1994). *Indices and identity.* Cambridge, MA.: MIT Press.

Fortin, Catherine (2007). "Indonesian sluicing and verb phrase ellipsis". Ph.D. Dissertation. University of Michigan.

Fox, Danny and Howard Lasnik (2003). "Successive cyclic movement and island repair: The difference between Sluicing and VP Ellipsis". In: *Linguistic Inquiry* 34.1, pp. 143–154.

Fukaya, Teruhiko (2007). "Sluicing and Stripping in Japanese and Some Implications". PhD thesis. Los Angeles, CA: University of Southern California.

Goldberg, Lotus Madelyn (2005). "Verb-Stranding VP Ellipsis: A Cross-Linguistic Study". PhD thesis. Montreal: McGill University.

Grebenyova, Lydia (2005). "Sluicing and Left-branch Extraction out of Islands". In: *Proceedings of the 24th West Coast Conference on Formal Linguistics*. Ed. by John Alderete, pp. 164–172.

Kim, Christina S et al. (2011). "The Acceptability Cline in VP Ellipsis". In: *Syntax* 14 (4), pp. 318–354.

Lakoff, George (1969). "On derivational constraints". In: *Papers from the Fifth Regional Meeting of the Chicago Linguistic Society*. Ed. by Robert I. Binnick et al. Chicago: Chicago Linguistic Society, University of Chicago.

Merchant, Jason (2001). *The Syntax of Silence: Sluicing, Islands, and the Theory of Ellipsis*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

— (2003). "Remarks on stripping". Ms. University of Chicago.

— (2004). "A deletion solution to the sloppy ellipsis puzzle". In: *Linguistic Society of America 75th annual meeting*. Boston, MA.

— (2008). "Variable Island Repair under Ellipsis". In: *Topics in Ellipsis*. Ed. by Kyle Johnson. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press, pp. 132–153.

— (in press). "Ellipsis". In: *Syntax - An international handbook of contemporary research*. Ed. by Artemis Alexiadou and Tibor Kiss. 2nd ed. Berlin: de Gruyter.

Nakao, Chizuru (2009). "Island repair and non repair by PF strategies". PhD thesis. College Park, MD: University of Maryland.

Nykiel, Joanna and Ivan A. Sag (2009). "Sluicing and stranding". In: *Paper presented at the 83rd LSA Meeting*. San Francisco, CA.

Park, Myung-Kwan (2004). "Phase, Cyclicity and Extraction out of Ellipsis in English". In: *Studies in Generative Grammar* 14.4, pp. 469–496.

Potsdam, Eric (2007). "Malagasy sluicing and its consequences for the identity requirement on ellipsis". In: *Natural Language and Linguistic Theory* 25, pp. 577–613.

Reinhart, Tanya (1993). "Elliptic Conjunctions – Non-Quantificational LF". In: *The Chomskyan Turn*. Ed. by Asa Kasher. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell Publishers, pp. 360–384.

Reinhart, Tanya (1997). "Quantifier scope: How labor is divided between QR and choice functions". In: *Linguistics and Philosophy* 20, pp. 335–397.

Rodrigues, Cilene, Andrew Ira Nevins, and Luis Vicente (2009). "Cleaving the interactions between sluicing and preposition stranding". In: *Romance Languages and Linguistic Theory 2006: selected papers from "Going Romance," Amsterdam, 7–9 december 2006*. Ed. by L. Wetzels and Jeroen van der Weijer. John Benjamins, pp. 175–198.

Ross, John (1967). "Constraints on variables in syntax". PhD thesis. Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

Ross, John Robert (1969). "Guess who?" In: *Papers from the Fifth Regional Meeting of the Chicago Linguistic Society*. Ed. by Robert I. Binnick et al. Chicago: Chicago Linguistic Society, University of Chicago, pp. 252–286.

Sato, Yosuke (2007). "P-stranding generalization and Bahasa Indonesia: a myth?" In: *Snippets* 16, pp. 17–18.

— (2010). *Minimalist Interfaces: Evidence from Indonesian and Javanese*. Linguistik aktuell 155. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Shuyler, Tamara (2002). "Wh-Movement out of the Site of VP Ellipsis". MA thesis. Santa Cruz, CA: UCSC.

Stjepanović, Sandra (2008). "P-Stranding under Sluicing in a Non-P-Stranding Language?" In: *Linguistic Inquiry* 39.1, pp. 179–190.

Szczegielniak, Adam (2005). *All sluiced up, but no alleviation in sight. . .* ms. Boston College.

— (2008). "Islands in Sluicing in Polish". In: *Proceedings of the 27th West Coast Conference on Formal Linguistics*. Ed. by Natasha Abner and Jason Bishop. Cascadilla Proceedings Project, pp. 404–412.

Temmerman, Tanja (to appear). "The syntax of Dutch embedded fragment answers: On the PF-theory of islands and the WH/sluicing correlation". In: *Natural Language and Linguistic Theory*.

Vicente, Luis (2006). *Exceptional cases of P-stranding under sluicing*. Ms. University of Leiden.

Wei, Ting-chi (Jan. 2011). "Parallelism in Amis Sluicing". In: *Concentric: Studies in Linguistics* 37.1, pp. 1–44.